



Sentencing for breaches of Health and Safety by very large organisations

Sentencing guidelines for safety breaches and environmental breaches are changing and are likely to increase substantially for large organisations. Case law is now indicating the practical effect of these changes.

Ahead of the implementation of the Sentencing Guidelines for Health and Safety Offences and Corporate Manslaughter, expected in October 2015, an environmental prosecution (where similar sentencing guidelines have already been implemented) provides some guidance on their potential interpretation; in particular with respect to the sentencing of very large organisations.

In *R v Thames Water Utilities* [2015] EWCA 960 the Court held that very large organisations (those with a turnover of £50,000,000 or over) that are found to have caused harm in the worst possible way, deliberate action or inaction, could now face a fine of up to 100% of its pre-tax net profit for the relevant year. The Court stated that this would be the case *“even if this results in fines in excess of £100m.”*

When considering the level of fine to be imposed on a very large organisation, the sentencing court did recognise that it must not simply multiply the level of fine by the incremental increases identified between other sizes of organisation (i.e. start with the fine for a large organisation and then multiply that range based on turnover.) as this would be an inappropriate *“mechanistic extrapolation.”* The financial circumstances of the organisation must be considered in the round given that a very large organisation might have high turnover but a small profit margin. A caveat which sounds promising; however, the appeal against sentence was rejected.

Thames Water Utilities had a turnover of £1.9bn and profits of £346m, it was fined £250,000 on the basis that it had been negligent in not replacing pumps earlier allowing untreated sewage to leak into a Natural Trust nature reserve.

The court recognised the strength of the remedial measures implemented by the company since the discharge, but considered the level of fine already reflected this and that due to its size the fine must remain significant. The Court emphasised that even in the case of a large organisation with an impeccable record *“the fine must be large enough to bring the appropriate message home*

to the directors and shareholders and to punish them.” This has been a message central to sentencing for some time, but was emphasised again here.

The prosecution attempted to provide a more precise definition for a ‘very large organisation’ as one with a *“turnover exceeding £150m per year on a three-yearly average.”* This was rejected by the Court as it stressed *“it will be obvious that it either is or is not very large. Doubtful cases must be resolved as and when they arise.”*

There remains uncertainty for very large organisations as to how they will be sentenced. The Court itself recognised this as a challenge and emphasised that *“sentencing very large organisations involves complex issues as is clear from this judgment.”* Undoubtedly, however, fines, in particular for large companies will increase significantly and in certain circumstances be in the multi-millions, the Court of Appeal in this case stated that it *“...would have had no hesitation in upholding a very substantially higher fine”.*

Contacts



Ann Metherall

Partner

+44 (0) 117 902 6629
ann.metherall@burgess-salmon.com



Matt Kyle

Senior Associate

+44 (0) 117 902 7215
matt.kyle@burgess-salmon.com



Hannah Craig

Trainee Solicitor

+44 (0) 117 307 6612
hannah.craig@burgess-salmon.com

Burgess Salmon LLP, One Glass Wharf, Bristol BS2 0ZX Tel: +44 (0) 117 939 2000 Fax: +44 (0) 117 902 4400
6 New Street Square, London EC4A 3BF Tel: +44 (0) 20 7685 1200 Fax: +44 (0) 20 7980 4966

www.burgess-salmon.com

Burgess Salmon LLP is a limited liability partnership registered in England and Wales (LLP number OC307212), and is authorised and regulated by the Solicitors Regulation Authority. It is also regulated by the Law Society of Scotland. Its registered office is at One Glass Wharf, Bristol BS2 0ZX. A list of the members may be inspected at its registered office. Further information about Burgess Salmon entities, including details of their regulators, is set out in the ‘Who we are’ section of the Burgess Salmon website at www.burgess-salmon.com.

© Burgess Salmon LLP 2015. All rights reserved. Extracts may be reproduced with our prior consent, provided that the source is acknowledged. Disclaimer: This briefing gives general information only and is not intended to be an exhaustive statement of the law. Although we have taken care over the information, you should not rely on it as legal advice. We do not accept any liability to anyone who does rely on its content.

Data Protection: Your details are processed and kept securely in accordance with the Data Protection Act 1998. We may use your personal information to send information to you about our products and services, newsletters and legal updates; to invite you to our training seminars and other events; and for analysis including generation of marketing reports. To help us keep our database up to date, please let us know if your contact details change or if you do not want to receive any further marketing material by contacting marketing@burgess-salmon.com.